

Africa Center of Excellence Higher Education Project for West and Central Africa

Aide Memoire

May 2016

I. Introduction

1. A regional supervision workshop¹ and Project Steering Committee was undertaken for the Africa Centers of Excellence in West and Central Africa in Ghana from May 16-19, 2016.
2. The Steering Committee meeting reviewed the project progress towards achievement of project effectiveness and disbursement to the ACEs.
3. The regional workshop achieved its objectives, which were:
 - Continue guidance and oversight of the regional facilitation unit at AAU;
 - Support ACEs in reaching the education and research results through knowledge sharing, clarifying operational procedures and encouragement, which will also lead to accelerated disbursement;
 - Review progress towards results verification and a second set of disbursements;
 - Put special emphasis and guidance on improving industry-university collaboration, teaching-learning techniques, and obtaining international accreditation.
 - Provide further fiduciary, safeguards, and disbursement guidance to the ACEs, in particular on the fiduciary DLIs due June 30, 2016;
 - Strengthen engagement with rectors and vice-chancellors on the ACE project and thereby build more ownership and improve project impact;
 - Plan for the mid-term review of the project to take place around Nov. 2016 – Feb. 2017.
4. Prior meetings for this mission included supervision and implementation support meetings at six selected centers in Burkina Faso, Nigeria, Ghana, and Togo as well as implementation support meetings in Cote d'Ivoire. In summary strong progress was observed in some centers where meetings with students showed good understanding of their courses and exposure to faculty and teaching environment. Summary of individual center progress and issues are highlighted in the Annex 1.
5. In Accra, the team and workshop participants met with Prof. Naana Jane Opoku-Agyemang, Minister of Education of the Republic of Ghana. For the first time, the workshop included vice chancellors and rectors of the universities housing the ACEs, in order to ensure their ownership of the project and ensure maximum support in project implementation. The review team would like to thank the Government of Ghana as well as the staff of the AAU, and all the ACEs for the excellent preparation of the meeting and preparations thus far made in project and exceptional commitment to work in partnership with the mission and in facilitating the review.

The World Bank team was comprised of Andreas Blom (Team Leader, Lead Economist), Eunice Yaa Brimfah Ackwerh (Senior Education Specialist and co-TTL Ghana), Charles Ashong (Sr. Procurement specialist), Robert Degraft-Hanson (Sr. Financial Management Specialist), Mouhamadou Moustapha Lo (Education Specialist), Pamela Mulet (Education Specialist and Co-TTL Togo), Adama Ouedraogo (Senior Education Specialist and co-TTL Burkina Faso), and Shawn Powers (Young Professional). Further Kathleen Beegle (Program Leader) participated in the workshop. Full attendance is in Annex 1.

6. The aide memoire is structured as follow: (I) Introduction, (II) Summary of key findings and overview of project-wide next steps; (III) specific country status and next steps; (IV) Financial management, procurement and Safeguards, and (V) overview of sectoral and regional facilitation.

II. Summary of Key Findings

A. Progress towards achievement of project Objectives

7. *Summary of overall progress:* Progress toward the Program Development Objective therefore continues to be rated Satisfactory. The ACE Project is under full implementation progress with many hard-won gains and individual ACEs showing signs of true excellence in their specific areas of strength. These include publication in high-impact journals, new partnerships with industry, movement of teachers and students across international borders, external revenue generation, and new student intake. Perhaps most importantly, most ACEs benefit from smart, dynamic students and strong and coherent teams. Efforts to accelerate progress towards international accreditation is also paying off. The operationalization of the results-based financing is also settling in with verification on-going and better shared understanding of the definition of the results. The M&E framework is strengthened and more timely and reliable and presented in ways leading to identification of strengths and weaknesses and hence for decision making. Government supervision and facilitation is taking shape in most countries, and regional supervision through AAU, the academic experts and the World Bank is equally more regular and effective. ACE understanding of fiduciary rules and reporting for the project is improving. Further, university-ACE integration is equally improving.

8. *Nevertheless, substantial challenges remain and will continue to require supervision and implementation progress has been downgraded to moderately satisfactory to reflect disbursement delays. . Key challenges include the ongoing disbursement delays and shortage of dollars for Nigerian ACEs and the need for greater use of funds by the ACEs. Further, the (expected) longer term challenges closely linked to the project's objective remain: Stronger link between education and research on one side with Industry and development needs on the other side; recruitment of regional students; raising learning outcomes of graduates and overall quality of programs to international levels; revenue generation of university impact of education and research. Also, around half of the ACEs needs to increase funds utilization. This relates the continued need to improve operational aspect of the project, notably information sharing, M&E reporting and usage, communication, financial management, and procurement at all levels (the Bank, regional facilitation, government, university and at the ACE level. If these challenges significantly improve in the next six months, and the first education results-based disbursements are released as expected, then it is anticipated that the implementation progress rating will be upgraded to Satisfactory.*

9. *KPI/ likelihood Development Objectives:* The progress of the PDO level indicators are:

- No. of national and regional students enrolled in new specialized short-term courses, and Master and PhD programs (measures strengthened capacities): 5,258 students.
- No. of regional students enrolled in new specialized short-term courses, Master and PhD programs (Regional aspect): 1,711 students.
- No. of internationally accredited education programs (Training quality): 1
- No. of students and faculty with at least 1month internship/outreach in companies or sector institutions relevant to their field (Training quality and addressing challenges): 1,020 students and faculty

- Amount of externally generated revenue by the ACEs (Training and research quality): US\$ 15.8 million

Detailed progress is captured in the tables on individual ACEs in Annex 1 and in institutional performance briefs.

TABLE 1: WOLRD BANK PROJECT RATINGS

	<i>Last</i>	<i>Now</i>	<i>Project Component Ratings:</i>	<i>Cost (\$M)</i>	<i>Last</i>	<i>Now</i>
Summary Development Objective Rating	S	S	Component 1: Strengthening Africa Centers of Excellence	155.80 M	S	S
Overall Implementation Progress	MS	MS	Component 2: Enhancing Regional Capacity; Evaluation and Collaboration	\$9.20 M	S	S
Financial Management	MS	MS				
Project Management	MS	MS				
Counterpart Funding	S	S				
Procurement	MS	MS				
Monitoring and Evaluation	S	MS				

S: Satisfactory; MS: Moderately Satisfactory

MU: Moderately Unsatisfactory; U: Unsatisfactory

10. *Status of Commitments and Disbursement:* The ACEs in Ghana and the Republic of Benin have received disbursement advances. The first verification and disbursement for education and research-related results is expected by June 30, 2016. Disbursement to the Nigerian ACEs remains largely stalled due to government-mandated changes in financial management, which have substantially delayed the flow of dollar funds. Disbursement to Cote d'Ivoire is also expected before end of the fiscal year given the progress on effectiveness. Main remaining challenges include processing of first withdrawal application using the results based approach

Table 1: Financial Summary as of May 15, 2016

Country	Original Amount in Currency	Disbursed in currency	% disbursed (incl. adv)
Gambia	2,000,000	974,214	49%
Nigeria	45,300,000	5,505,851	12%
Senegal	10,400,000	2,216,716	21%
Burkina Faso	5,200,000	1,104,436	21%
Benin	5,300,000	1,126,812	21%
Cameroon	5,200,000	1,136,935	22%
Ghana	15,600,000	3,756,678	24%
Togo	5,200,000	1,099,900	21%
Cote d'Ivoire	16,700,000	0	0%
AAU	3,300,000	1,737,663	53%
Project wise	114,200,000	18,659,205.63	16%

Note: All currency in SDR

Project wide Next Steps

11. Below are key steps for each priority at the project-wide level between now and November 2016. The key next steps for each country and each ACE are summarized in the Section B by country and in Annex 1 for individual ACEs (for the countries with more than 1 ACE).

Smooth flow of disbursements

- Work toward speedy resolution of Nigeria flow of funds situation – WB and AAU - ASAP
- For 5 pilot ACEs for verification (selected on the basis of need for additional funding and completeness of information submitted: CEFOR, ACEGID, WACCI, PAMI, and WACCBIP): AAU verification letter (& TTL letter) for 5 pilot ACEs - June 20
- Verification for next 14 centers:
 - Start of verification for the remaining 14 ACEs – June 15
 - AAU verification letter (& TTL letter) - July 30
- First disbursement of ACE project in Cote d'Ivoire
 - Submission of results for DLI 1 & AAU letter of achievement of DLI 1 – June 15
 - Communication of EEPs, accounts and signatories by centers – June 15
 - First withdrawal application – June 25

Timely and appropriately project steering and supervision:

- Regular communication: ACE Audio Conference – AAU - July 20, 2016
- Steering committee meeting Video Conference – AAU/WB – mid-August 2016
- National review committee meetings – AAU/WB – Sept/October 2016
- Site/supervision visits to 5-7 ACEs – AAU/WB and Government focal points – by end October 2016
- Implementation support meetings face-to-face or via the video for individual ACEs – All - On-going, as per need basis

ACE submission deadlines:

- Financial management and procurement audits and evidence of institutional oversight (for disbursements) by June 30, 2016
- Unaudited Interim Financial Report for 1st semester 2016 by August 15
- Indicators for Disbursement by October 15, 2016

Regional Facilitation, Project Planning by the RFU and due at the next Steering Committee meeting

- Distribution of institutional performance briefs – June 30
- Set up a meeting with M&E and centers leaders for technical support and more clarification for readiness of the verification
- Organize pre-accreditation workshops with ABET and HCERES and continued assistance to locate international accreditation opportunities – AAU and WB – On-going basis
- Revenue Generation Strategy and follow-up
- Update Regional Operational Manual
- Proposal on Scientific/Relevance Advisory Committee
- Engage architects as consultants to assist with verification of DLR 2.8 for construction
- Update definitions of DLIs

6th ACE workshop and Steering Committee meeting in Ouagadougou, Burkina Faso, November 15-17, 2016

B. Country Status and Key Next Steps

Nigeria

12. *Nigeria Country Status*. Progress since last supervision:

- The 10 ACEs in Nigeria have made progress in student enrolment as follows:
Total student enrolment: 1,879
Regional students: 479 (Females = 115)
(PhD = 58; MSc = 87; Short courses = 334)
National students: 1,399 (Females = 458)
- Seven ACEs have appointed external auditors for the purpose of auditing the activities of the Centres, while the others are on the verge of engaging theirs. The audit of the NUC ACE Secretariat account by the Office of the Auditor General of the Federation was completed on the 13 May 2016. All external audit reports are due in June 2016.
- The Centres have generated income externally in the range of USD5,187,483.00 (Five million, one hundred and eighty-seven thousand, four hundred and eighty-three Dollars only)
- The ACEs are continuously exploring and expanding industry partnerships which are yielding results in terms of revenue generation, infrastructural and faculty development at the Centres.
- All the ACEs have functional websites.
- The NUC successfully organized a week long capacity enhancement and sustainability workshop for the 10 ACEs in Nigeria and the NUC ACE Secretariat in January 2016.
- The NUC hosted the Revenue Generation Training organized by the AAU for the ACEs in Nigeria.
- The second NPPRC meeting was held in January 2016, and the membership of the Committee was expanded by accommodating Ministries that are relevant to the various focal areas of the ACEs.
- All ACEs have approved 2016 work/procurement plans.
- Considering the environmental impact of some of the ACEs' activities (e.g. construction and medical and lab wastes), 6 ACEs have appointed Environmental Safeguard Officers while the other 4 Centres have their Centre Leaders filling the gap temporarily.
- Five ACEs have computerized their accounting system while the rest are in the process.
- All the ACEs have publications in National and some international journals since February 2014
- The NUC has notified all the ACEs on the need to maintain the academic and quality assurance standards as set by the Commission, including entry requirements.

13. *Nigeria Challenges*

- Serious challenges in project implementation following the Federal Government directive on the Treasury Single Accounts (TSA) whereby all government Ministries, Departments and Agencies (MDA), including federal universities are required to transfer all accounts from the commercial banks to the Central Bank of Nigeria (CBN). The TSA issue has negatively affected project implementation in terms of flow of funds.

- The NUC ACE secretariat is yet to receive No Objection for its 2016 Work and Procurement plan.
- The NUC has not been able to procure the requested Accounting software since last year (2015) because the World Bank is yet to give a No Objection. The funding situation at the NUC has also not allowed for payment of the accounting software outside the ACE funds.
- The ACEs are yet to apply to the NUC for Resource Verification, which is usually the first step towards programme accreditation for new programmes and some existing programmes.
- In some cases, admission process and requirements were not clearly disclosed to prospective students and as such, due process of some universities were not followed.
- The ACEs are faced with the challenge of enrolling foreign students into their programmes.

14. *Nigeria Next Steps*

- Follow up with the Central Bank of Nigeria (CBN) and Office of the Accountant General of the Federation (OAGF) on the accounts on the TSA platform to ensure that the accounts issues are finalized by June 30, 2016
- Follow up with the World Bank to reply to the request for No Objection for the NUC ACE Secretariat 2016 work plan by June 10, 2016.
- Follow up with the World Bank to reply to the request for No Objection for the procurement of Accounting software for the NUC ACE Secretariat by June 10, 2016
- Ensure that all the ACEs apply for Resource Verification by July 30, 2016
- Engagement of Procurement Audit firms to audit the procurement activities of the ACEs in Nigeria by June 15, 2016 at the latest
- Preparation towards training workshop for the Safeguard Officers of all the ACEs due to take place before June 30, 2016.
- Preparing for ACE Advisory Committee meetings
- Preparing for the third and fourth NPPRC meetings scheduled to hold in June & December 2016.
- Continue the weekly NUC ACE Implementation meetings
- Development of the NUC ACE project website by June 30, 2016
- Publication of ACE project quarterly journal to reflect the activities of the 10 ACEs. Maiden edition to be published by August 30, 2016
- Airing of ACE project activities in Nigeria through the NUC Television sponsored program “The Voyage of Discovery” by September 2016
- Encourage the ACEs in Nigeria to vigorously pursue international accreditation and to start such process early.

Ghana

15. *Ghana Country Status.*

Ghana successfully hosted the 5th ACE Implementation Support Workshop in Accra Ghana from May 16 to 20, 2016 starting with the Project Steering Committee Meeting on May 16, 2016.

Achievement on Disbursement Linked Results

ACE	Total Students	Regional
WACCI-UG	65	45
WACCBIP-UG	147	19
RESCK-KNUST	57	5

ACE	Accreditation	Internship	Publication	Income Generated (US\$)
WACCI-UG	2	41	17	5.5 m
WACCBIP-UG	8	24	61	1.7 m
RESCK-KNUST	0	0	28	7,200

The Ghana ACEs are performing well on DLRs, above the ACE average for number of PhDs, MScs, proportion of regional students, female students, accreditation of programs, external internships, publication and income generation.

Resolution of Issues from Benin workshop. Several issues identified during the last mission have been resolved. Currently scholarships for PhDs and MScs provided by the ACEs under the project are committed for the entire study period and various incentives are being provided for students especially regional students including—scholarships including accommodation and a stipend. Funds transferred to partners are accounted for by the ACEs which provide fiduciary oversight of these resources. The issue of advances for the Ghana ACEs has been resolved with a request from the Ministry of Finance to review the Disbursement Letter to include advances. With this review of the disbursement letter in March 2016 and on the basis of workplans and cashflow budgets which were approved by the World Bank, all Ghana’s three ACEs have received advances transferred through the World Bank platform to their designated accounts to the tune of US\$3 million in April 2016. The disbursed funds under the DLI may be used to cover travel and approved project activities from February 2014. Subsequent funding will be IFR-based following verified DLRs, which will cover expenditures made at least equal to or more than the funds to be disbursed against DLRs achieved.

16. Ghana Challenges

- Accreditation for WACCI (agriculture) is challenged by limited globally recognized accrediting agencies for Agriculture. WACCBIP has identified the Royal Society for Biology, UK and has scheduled an evaluation site visit for October 12 to 16, 2016.
- Sustainability—Government of Ghana must find a way of creating a budget line for e.g. from the Ghana Education Trust Fund (GETFund) to sustain activities beyond the project.
- There is the need for clarity on safeguards to ensure that new construction is completed speedily. Safeguards specialist to organize VC for three Ghana ACEs to provide guidance on construction
- Procurement of equipment should be more streamlined as advertisement attracts middlemen. Procurement for science equipment and reagents should be directly from manufacturer.

17. Ghana Next Steps

- Update workplan and budget forecast for second half of 2016
- Plan safeguard and procurement visits to ACEs
- Follow up on accreditation process for each ACE

Senegal

18. *Senegal Country Status*. Progress made since last supervision:

- The national committee meeting has been held (April 1, 2016) with participation from key stakeholders. Both Centers took stock on the main achievements and bottlenecks.
- Both Centers have started the process for international accreditation. CEA-MITIC has sent a letter of interest to HCERES and design key next steps with them. For CEA SAMEF both institutions (HCERES and Royal College of Physicians and Surgeons of Canada) will be engaged for the accreditation of DES and Master and PhD. After the contact visit of Royal College of P&S in Senegal in November 26 to 27, 2015, a delegation of the CEA SAMEF held a visit in College Royal (April 4 to 8, 2016) in order to appropriate the process and familiarize with key processes. Moreover, the national process with ANAQ-Sup (national quality insurance agency) has started with MITIC. Some programs have already been submitted for self-evaluation.
- High level scientific event has been organized by MITIC among others, the scientist day co-organized with International LIRIMA laboratory (May 2015), School in Bioinformatics with Institut-Pasteur and INDA (September 2015), National Symposium on Research in Computer Science and Applications (October 2015), Research School on probabilistic model infectious diseases, (December, 2015)
- After the signing of the contract with Gambia, the CEA-MITIC fully started the training of the student. To date, 67 Gambian students have been enrolled to the ACE. The innovation of this approach is that instead of having the students coming in Senegal which increases substantially training costs, the UGB faculty travel to Gambia to train students on the ground;
- For the improvement of the learning environment, the CEA MITIC has undertaken considerable efforts to get approved and signed by the Ministry of Finance the contract with the architecture cabinet. The civil work has started. A follow up committee has been set up to provide smooth support. The SAMEF's DLI2.8 included a medicalized bus that was finally approved by the Bank after a letter of justification of the relevance of this equipment. A work plan for utilization will be provided.
- The centers have submitted their reports for the DLIs and achievements in the Results framework up to March 2016.
- The IFR for 2015 is approved and submitted to the Bank. The ToRs for the external audit is sent to the Ministry of Finance which is in processing. The audit will concern procurement and financial management for both centers at the same time.

19. *Senegal Next Steps*

- Finalize the statute of the center in line with the ongoing university reforms. A meeting with the centers and the higher education authorities will be organized to come up with specific statute of the centers that is in line with the ongoing reforms.
- Provide the utilization plan of medicalized bus – June 30
- Pursue the process of validation of the referential for the national accreditation of the medicine programs. The head of the Directorate of Higher Education will meet with ANAQ-Sup to provide necessary assistance for the national accreditation of ACEs programs for both centers.
- The official launch of the project with the Ministry of Higher Education and key ACEs partners and stakeholders (Before end of June 2016).
- Finalizing criteria and recruitment of Masters and PhD Students for UCAD – June 30

- Strengthen the communication to make the center more visible and impactful at the national and regional level
- Make functional the internal audit department which was one of the key effectiveness conditions. The progress made so far by both centers will be reported – June 30.
- Do due diligence in the processes of acquisition of equipment and recruitment of Masters and PhD students.
- Be ready for the upcoming verification of DLI achievements. Technical support will be provided by the World Bank to get both centers ready before the verification process – June 15, 2016.

Togo

20. *Country status - Togo* - Following the Fourth ACE Project Workshop held in Cotonou in November 2015, and a supervision mission from 21 to 23 March 2016, the World Bank team wishes to congratulate CERSA for the significant progress made in the implementation the project, and strongly encourages to continue its efforts to achieve project indicators.

The effort made by CERSA towards organizing a meeting in March 2016, with leaders of the private sector in Togo, is an example of good practice. The World Bank invites the CERSA to pursue this openness to the private sector.

The implementation of CERSA revolves around the following five action plans: 1. Excellence in governance and operation; 2. Excellence in education and training; 3. Excellence in research; 4. Development Impact 5. Strengthening educational and research infrastructures. These action plans guide the implementation of the Centre's activities. The following summarizes the (i) progress made in the implementation of these five areas and (ii) conclusions and recommendations, jointly produced by the CERSA and mission of the World Bank at the end of the debate and analysis of the documents.

Action Plan 1: Excellence in governance and operations

- CERSA oversight. CERSA's steering bodies are operational and are made up with eight commissions which meet on regular basis. The steering committee meets twice a year.
- Monitoring and Evaluation. The monitoring and evaluation system is operational and contributes to an effective monitoring of information.
- Fiduciary Management. An external audit firm has been engaged in January 2016. The purchase of the accounting software remains an important recommendation which is yet to be fulfilled by the Centre. The team reiterates the importance of acquiring as faster as earlier as possible the recommended accounting software. Regarding procurement, as agreed in the DLI 4.1, it is recommended to conduct an audit of contracts before 30th June 2016.

- Communication. The team congratulates CERSA for officially launching the Center at national level as well as producing a movie about the Center.
- Capacity Building. Capacity building related activities are organized both at national and regional level.
- Environmental and Social Safeguard. CERSA received a national certification approval for the Environmental and Social Management Plan (ESMP) from the National Agency of Environmental Management (ANGEL-Togo) to undertake rehabilitation operations. The team indicated that all the documents relating to environmental and social issues should be sent by May 30, 2016.
- Partnerships. Partnership agreements were signed: two regional and 4 international.

Action Plan 2: Excellence in education and training: done

- 3 new curricula developed with the support of Belgian Dutch, French and Nigerian experts
- 27 Master students including 8 regional students enrolled and 30 Master students are selected and their registration scheduled for June 2016
- Internship for 27 students
- 6 PhD students enrolled including one regional student
- Modular training: 131 young entrepreneurs trained
- Revenue generated: US \$ 56,000
- Commitment to the path of international accreditation process: Sending a letter of intent to HCERS
- Five days capacity building for 74 faculty who received a training in the 7 thematic of CERSA

21. Togo - Planning Next Steps.

Regarding the last 3 action plans: (i) Excellence in research; (ii) development impact; and (iii) Strengthening of educational and research facilities, the team asks the Centre to accelerate activities related to these action plans. Beyond the above recommendations, the World Bank team invites the CERSA and the Ministry of Higher Education and Research to make meaningful progress in the next 6 months on the following:

- Develop a partnership strategy with industry at national and international level in order for the Centre to significantly improve its revenue generation.
- Make changes on the legal status of the Centre to facilitate the implementation of CERSA program.
- In order to improve the implementation of the program, the team suggests to CERSA to rigorously follow the attached roadmap in appendix 5 with actions, person in charge and deadline.

Benin

22. *Benin – Status* - This report is based on the Disbursement Linked Indicators (ILD) and gives an update of activities since the last meeting of the Centers of Excellence in Cotonou.

Capacity building in teaching / learning and excellence in education.

Under this action the following activities were carried out:

- Various teaching assignments in the various training programs being offered (Probability and Mathematical Statistics, Science Education, Basic Mathematics). Teaching missions were funded at the African School of Economics, partner institution of ACEA-SMA.
- Defense of thesis at Masters level of basic mathematics was held;
- Les soutenances de mémoires de MASTER pour les étudiants en mathématiques fondamentales ont été organisées ;

Capacity building and excellence in research and productivity and strengthening the academic/sectorial partnership and research

Trois agreements have been finalized and signed to strengthen the partnership and academic research. These are the following agreements:

- Agreement with the University Pierre and Marie Curie, for the establishment of a Master in Mathematical Modeling
- Agreement with the University of Evry for strengthening the team working on Algebra and Number Theory
- Agreement with the Painlevé Laboratory of the University of Lille 1 on algebraic geometry, probability, and numerical analysis

Strengthening governance and sustainable management. The following activities were carried out:

- Participation in training on the management of projects financed by the World Bank in Abidjan from 15 to 26 February 2016;
- Training members of the public procurement and market control bodies of UAC and members of technical team on implementation of African Centre of Excellence on Mathematics and Applications from 14 to 18 March 2016;
- Recruitment of a firm to undertake accounting, financial and procurement audits.

Concerning DLI 2.6 which was the specific subject matter of the Accra meeting, ACE-SMA has a good scientific record in terms of publications in indexed journals.

23. *Benin – challenges* - It should be noted here that various challenges obstructed the normal course of activities. Among these difficulties, we can mention:

- The technical support team is not a team exclusively dedicated to the project. This therefore leads to a delay in the implementation of procurement procedures.
- Teachers of the Institute of Mathematics and Physics (IMSP) do not seem to have completely appropriate the project of Centres of Excellence.

24. *Benin - Planning the Next Steps*

- Several meetings were held with the team put up by the office of UAC Vice-chancellor and the leader of the project. The recruitment of two officers to support the technical team was suggested. UAC will also provide staff better to expand the technical team.
- A meeting will be held during the second fortnight of June to present the achievement of the project's objectives to the teaching staff of IMSP and to other entities of the UAC involved in the ACE-SMA project.
- Finalize the procurement contract on the internet connectivity, purchasing books for the library, teaching materials (video conference equipment for distance learning)
- Finalize the necessary documents on the computer centre and submit the bidding documents.
- Visit the partners to increase the number of students and open admission within the shortest possible time
- Organize successfully the next analysis conference in December 2016. The conference will be attended by Cédric Villani, President of the Council of Scientific and Pedagogic Orientation.

Burkina Faso

25. *Burkina Faso - Status*

A World Bank team including an expert from the Association of African Universities visited ACE 2iE from 9 to 10 May 2016. The team noted with satisfaction the progress made by 2iE in the implementation of the Project. The team met leaders of 2iE as well as students of the Centre of Excellence and private sector companies working in partnership with 2iE (Total, Groupe Vergnet, SOGEA-SATOM). The team also inspected teaching facilities and laboratories of 2iE. At the end of the visit, all parties expressed satisfaction on progress made and the results so far achieved. Concerning solutions to key implementation challenges that may interest other centers of excellence, the team

recommended that 2iE should **task the general supervision mission to agree on a common ground.**

In general, since the Cotonou workshop, ACE 2iE has reached a satisfactory level of the objectives of its implementation plan. Concerning the objectives set out in Cotonou in November 2015, several indicators have reached or exceeded their targets. Only three indicators remain below their targets. These are: (i) the indicator on accredited educational programs that has not changed since 2iE wished, for the moment, to focus on enhancing quality of existing programs; (ii) the indicator on income generation remains at about 40% of the target to be achieved; (iii) the indicator showing the number of newly or revised curriculum is 5, not 7 as expected. Specific actions are being taken to reach the target of all the indicators. The external audit is on track. The Terms of Reference have been submitted and approved by the Bank and the audit will be conducted in June 2016.

According to the implementation plan, since November 2015, the following activities were carried out:

- Recruitment of the second batch of local students on scholarship (February 2016 admission), forty three (43) Master students "Water and Sanitation" and "Water Resources Infrastructure".
- Validation and publication of the Internal Audit Report
- Recruitment of a firm to undertake studies and civil works in the ACE
- Inventory of work and needs in educational and scientific materials CEA
- Reorganization, planning and budgeting of year 2 activities (30 June 2016) and meeting with officers in charge with other components.
- Preparation of procurement of computers for students and a Generator
- Report of Semester 1 of Year 2 (October 31, 2015) (submit to AAU)
- Financial reporting of the 2nd semester 2015 (submitted and approved by the WB)
- Completion of the DLI 2.8 (complete list of equipment being finalized)
- Review and submission of the Procurement Plan to the BM (validation underway)
- Submission and validation of external audit TDRs outside the BM
- Participation in the Benchmarking survey on PASET and WB project (April 2016)
- Hosting a delegation from UDS (Partner from Ghana) at 2iE for a working meeting in the framework of ACE-WB project (24-27 April 2016)

26. *Burkina Faso - challenges.* Centre of Excellence 2iE has encountered some difficulties / challenges regarding programming:

- Accreditation: In the French-speaking set up, regional accreditation is a real challenge for Francophone ACE. What are the solutions in project timing?
- Scientific production: How to take into account in assessing the quality of scientific research, in addition to peer-reviewed articles, other popular articles

constituting a real channel of transfer of scientific and technological innovations which have a real impact on development?

- The difficulties in the collection and processing of data / information for M & E (compatibility with the existing information system)
- The difficulties in the collection and processing of data / information for M & E (compatibility with the existing information system)
- Students do not understand the reason why English should be a condition for the issuance of CTI degree in Engineering. The institute to review recruitment criteria conditions with a minimum level of English and strengthen the provision of learning from the first year. Possibility of preparatory classes in English.
- The delay in the procurement process (lengthy procurement procedures). Better anticipation for year 2. The exit of the expert in procurement (reorganization of the team pending further recruitment underway).

27. *Burkina Faso – next steps*

- Holding the 2nd meeting of the National Committee for Monitoring and Evaluation (June-July 2016)
- Preparation of procurement and tender documents
- Recruitment of the third and final batch of local scholarship students (beginning of September 2016): 14 Master students
- Undertake of the external audit and audit of procurement (June 2016)

Cameroon

28. *Cameroon – Country Status.*

Overall, there has been good progress on CETIC, but a number of challenges remain and important time has been lost. Notably, the following gains have been made:

- A separate supervision and implementation mission took place Dec 2 and 3 in Yaoundé to accelerate implementation
- The first national review committee meeting took place Avril 2016
- The CETIC and Yaoundé I team have strengthened its focus on the key area of excellence of the ACE, notably mathematical modeling and its applications.
- Stronger coordination between the central university administration and CETIC.
- There have been concrete progress in form of increased integration of regional students
- Good progress on the research science front through publication
- Some progress on identifying a suitable international accreditation body

29. *Cameroon - Challenges :*

- Accelerate implementation.
- Gestion financière et passation des marchés. Plusieurs séances de travail avec l'équipe du projet se sont tenues à Yaoundé pour clarifier que les procédures de gestion qui s'appliquent sont celles contenues dans le manuel de procédures et doivent être en cohérence avec les procédures nationales, aussi bien en gestion financière qu'en passation

des marchés. Il est aussi important que les ressources du CETIC soient inscrites dans le budget de l'Université, aussi bien en ressources qu'en dépenses. Un défi urgent est la soumission du report financier intermédiaire.

- Accreditation and achievement of the quality results remains a challenge despite some progress. There is not a strong experience with external quality assurance in the Cameroonian university system.
- Faculty incentives for the additional work required by the project.
- Enhance Revenue generation poses a problem within the existing legal framework. Namely, tuition fees goes to the state and all expenditures have to be within the approved governmental budget.

30. *Cameroon – Next steps*

- Video meeting with AAU and the World Bank to plan the concrete next step – June 30
- Submission of the latest IFR – June 15
- Finalization of the civil works plans and formulation of the DLI2.8 – June 30

Côte d'Ivoire

31. *Cote d'Ivoire - Status*

- Inception of the project: 16 February 2016
- Opening a designated account for the project at BCEAO: December 18, 2015
- Opening a designated account for each CEA at BNI: March 2016
- Workshop on income generation: 21-22 April 2016
- Issuance of the statement of intent and the letter of inception: 9 May 2016

32. *Cote d'Ivoire - Next Steps*

- Integrating funds allocated to the CEA to state budget - underway - MPEF
- Opening additional two accounts for each CEA: one for disbursement linked indicators and the second for revenues generated - underway - MPEF
- Transmission ACE's EEPS to AAU and to the WB -15 June 2016 - MPEF
- Configuring ACE accounts on the platform of the World Bank - end of May 2016 - Financial Management unit of the World Bank
- Presentation of the implementation of DLI 1 to AAU for verification - June 15, 2016 - CNS and ACE
- Verification of DLI 1 – 20 June 2016 - AAU
- Processing of the first disbursement for achieving DLI 1 - 30 June 2016- WB
- Holding of the 1st meeting of CNS: - mid-June 2016 - Focal Point

The Gambia

33. *The Gambia – Country Status*

To date, the Gambia has disbursed 49% of the total project funds of US\$3 Million. Out of the eight ACEs where Gambian students are enrolled, Gaston Berger constitutes 55.4% of total enrolment, followed by Benin City and Yaounde I (14.9% and 14.0%, respectively). 28.1% of the enrolled students are currently in the four Centres in Nigeria. The majority of the enrolled students are studying in-country given the arrangement with Gaston Berger to use UTG facilities to run the programme in The Gambia. Following the nomination and admissions of Gambian students in various ACEs, the Project Management team led by the Permanent Secretary mounted a monitoring visit to all ACEs where Gambian students are enrolled.

34. *The Gambia Challenges*

- Language: Insufficient French classes for students at some francophone ACEs. For intensive lectures, students wanted lecture notes, ideally in English, in advance so they can read for ease of comprehension.
- IT: Most students report a lack of internet access at their residencies. MSc students have strongly justified the need for laptops (this was only planned for PhD students). There is a possibility of negotiating this with the ACEs if they have a system of one laptop per student.
- Curriculum: For MSc students, wanted to have their course programs and practical conducted in parallel, especially in agriculture, but in practice these happen sequentially.
- Administrative: Admission and registration issues at ACE centers where these requirements were not clearly communicated before the students were sent. In some ACEs, students have stayed for more than 3 months without being registered. Students were not informed about the residence permit requirements, e.g. in Cameroon.

35. *The Gambia Next Steps*

These are less next steps than recommendations for the ACE project:

- ACEs who have not done so already should prepare brochures or flyers to properly spell out the basic requirements for admission and other benefits for international students, e.g. visa issues, accommodation, residence permits, etc.
- Provide more French lessons for bilingual students, and lecture notes in advance if possible.
- Increase intake of MSc and PhD students in other relevant areas not included in the first phase.

C. Procurement, Financial Management and Safeguards

Procurement Compliance

36. The procurement session of the workshop enabled frank discussions on the Project legal agreement and procurement requirements therein as well as the approach to the achievement of the procurement DLI. The overall issues of the countries were as follows:

- (i) Nigeria - Exchange rate challenges;
- (ii) Cote d'Ivoire – What procurement procedures govern the project?
- (iii) Ghana – Whose responsibilities it is to conduct the Annual procurement Audit and when it must be submitted?
- (iv) Togo -delays in country procurement systems and the Low procurement thresholds;

- (v) Burkina Faso – Procurement procedures and guidelines to use? when to seek No Objection and the Procurement Audit?
- (vi) Senegal - Challenges to send goods to beneficiary who are not in the country.

The answers and clarifications are below.

37. It is noted that this Workshop Procurement session confirmed the agreement of the previous ACE Workshop in November 2015, namely that the legal bases for implementation of the project is the legal Financing Agreements, including the required approaches to achieving the procurement DLRs. Further general information on procurement implementation was discussed. The procurement presentation is available on the AAU ACE-website. The issues emphasised in the workshop were as follows:

- *Roles:*
 - a. The Bank’s role is to Supervise Project implementation and monitor compliance with the Financing Agreement including procurement requirement while sharing knowledge and information.
 - b. The Borrower (Centers and AAU/RFU)’s role is to implement the Project in compliance with Financing Agreement.
- *Procurement Procedures:* As stated in the Financing Agreement, Minutes to the Negotiations and the PAD, the project has two components with two financing instruments:
 - a. Component 1 (ACEs): Results Based linked to DLIs, which reimburses the agreed Eligible Expenditure Program (Salaries of permanent university staff). Procurement of project expenditures (goods, travel, services etc.) in the procurement plan follows the approved implementing Agency’s procurement systems and thresholds. Because the Centers are housed in Government institutions their procurement systems are the country’s procurement system with the approved procurement manuals of the Centers expanding on the country procurement system.
 - b. Component 2 (AAU, NUC (Nigeria, and The Gambia): Transaction based using Bank Procurement Guidelines.
- *Timely Procurement Audit (DLR4.1):* In accordance to the Schedule 2 para F1 and 2 of the Financing Agreement, the Procurement Audit is the responsibility of the Participating Universities, and by extension, the respective Centers, so the Centers have a responsibility to ensure that that is done as they are the beneficiaries of the DLR4.1. Each ACE is to have a third party procurement verification report, usually on an annual basis. The Audit shall cover the period of one fiscal year and the report must be furnished to the Bank not later than 6 months after the end of such period. The Financing Agreement requires that the external independent procurement auditor should have been recruited by 6 months after project effective date. First deadline for submission is June 30, 2016. The Procurement Audit is to review the entire procurement implementation of the Center to check compliance and conformity to the legal agreement on the agreed procurement systems and procedures. The Centers will furnish to the Bank (the Bank regional team-lead, the country team-lead and the country procurement specialist) with the stage of the procurement and implementation of the Procurement Audit and timelines of deliverables going forward.
- *Timely and Satisfactory Procurement Progress (DLR 4.2):* (25% of all procurement contracts signed by year 1; 55% by year 2, and 100% by year 3, and verification of installation by year 4). It was explained to the Centers that this refers to the number (No) of all procurement covering the entire Project, and hence the measurement is cumulative and relative to the whole.

- *Procurement planning*: To realise DLI 4.2 the Centers should have prepared procurements covering the entire Project instead of the yearly procurement planning. The Centers were advised to start preparing complete procurement covering the entire project so the computation of the DLI4.2 can be done accordingly, going forward. The workshop showed a table that the Centers should use in computing their progress to measure their DLI 4.2.
- *Procurement Progress Reporting*: The Centers were referred to Schedule 2 para 4 of the Financing Agreement, which requires that such report must be submitted to the Bank every semester. Annex 2 provides a suggested template.
- *Requests for No Objection*:
 - a. For the ACEs: The Bank does NOT require prior no objection on any procurement in the approved Procurement plan as long as the procurement will follow the agreed institutional procedures. This includes No Objection for ToRs and workshops.
 - b. For the ACEs: The Bank only requires prior no objection on:
 - Annual procurement plan (together with the annual workplan)
 - ToRs for fiduciary and safeguard consultants
 - Procurable items not included in the approved procurement plan
 - Procurable item when the agreed procurement procedures are not followed
 - c. For Component 2 – AAU, NUC (Nigeria), and Gambia: As per standard Bank procurement guidelines
 - All ToRs
 - All Workshops
 - International travel
 - Items above the agreed thresholds

If the ACEs would like technical support on the TORs, they may approach the Bank for that but this will not amount to Bank No Objection, except in case where both the Borrower and the Bank agrees for Bank prior review for complex and high value.

- *Compliance with combating fraud and anti-corruption*: All activities to be supported under the project will adhere to the World Bank “Guidelines on Preventing and Combating Fraud and Corruption in Projects Financed by IBRD Loans and IDA Credits and Grants, dated October 2006 and revised in January 2011”.
- *Procurement Compliance*: The Centers were informed that only procurements emanating from the Approved Work Plan & Budget is eligible on the Procurement Plan. Similarly, only procurable Items on the approved Procurement Plan must be procured. Given that the ACE’s implementation is Results Based Linked to DLI, the non-compliance of Procurement provisions in the Legal Agreement leaves the Bank with several options in case of non-compliance: (i) declaring misprocurement; (ii) Withholding of the Amount for the procurement DLI; (iii) advising that all the procurements going forward shall be prior reviewed; (iv) cause for a forensic procurement audit, and (vi) cancel the Project and stop funding.
- *Things to Avoid*: The workshop advised the Projects to avoid Conflict of Interest, Ineligibilities, Unfair Competitive Advantage, Mis-procurement and Fraud and Corruption practices as they have serious impact on project procurement implementation with heavy sanctions.
- *Observation on Procurement Implementation*: The workshop shared and discussed Pre-Contract and Post-Contract Procurement and Contract management issues with the Project

teams and advise that all projects adhere to the agreed rules stated in the ruling procurement guidelines as well as the detailed information in the Manuals.

- *Currency Exchange challenges:* The smooth flow of funds in local and international currency to ACEs, including in Nigeria, is being pursued and since the Project allocation is in Dollars, this should not be a long term problem.
- *Senegal issue on sending items:* The workshop advised the Center to craft their Contract document with a destination clearly stated to be that of the beneficiary so that the Supplier takes into consideration the transportation to the Beneficiary as well.

38. Finally the Project were reminded that once the Technical decisions are made and settled on “(Approved Work Plan and Budget-WP&B) for the project, Procurement is the vehicle used by the Borrower (whether by itself or use of private – external service providers) to implement the project to achieve the required results and the objectives of the Project. Therefore, the procurement plan requires that the Borrower indicates under which component the particular procurement falls and what results it will achieve. Therefore a delay in preparing a realistic WP&B and Procurement Plan with timely approval of the Bank as well as timely execution significantly delay project implementation and the achievement of the PDO. Furthermore, the constant updating of the Plan and its use as a Management and M&E tool allows the Borrower to be on top of procurement delivery and proactively identify bottlenecks, institute and implement mitigation measures in time.

Monitoring and Evaluation

39. *Monitoring and evaluation has improved since November 2015 in several ways:* (i) institutional performance briefs are now available and have been shared with each ACE as a constructive benchmarking tool; (ii) there is more timely submission of indicators and better common understanding of each indicator; (iii) verification of results is progressing.

40. *Nevertheless, some challenges to a robust and timely M&E system still remain,* notably: (a) need to fully complete the first verification of results; (b) develop a project-wide brief, and (c) further inform about the definition of DLR indicators.

41. *Change from cumulative to annual reporting.* One issue is that the M&E reports from some of the ACEs showed a decrease in the level of some indicators which are tracked cumulatively, which is not possible for cumulative indicators. The M&E team proposed doing away with cumulative reporting and only collecting raw data, but some concerns about this approach were raised, so this issue will be resolved after the workshop. Some centers also submitted data which were not specific to the ACE’s activities, but rather for the whole university.

42. *An analysis of ACE research publication output was presented.* The ACEs published 2,693 papers in 2010-2014. The ACEs collective Field-Weighted Citation Index (FWCI, an indicator of research impact) is around the world average, slightly exceeding it by 2013. The STEM ACEs, especially CETIC and PAMI, are most prolific, while the health ACEs are most cited. ACEGID is most impactful, with triple the world average FWCI, and represents 30% of ACE-generated citations. Agriculture ACEs have lowest output, but many of the ACE participants noted that the gestation period for agriculture research is often longer than for laboratory science.

43. *Frequently asked questions among the ACEs about the definitions of some of the DLIs were reviewed.* In particular, there is a need to further enhance a common understanding of each indicator. This is critical for a speedier verification. The verification suggested that the definition of quality of education results (accreditation) and internships were not poorly understood and/or

communicated. Further, a number of special cases were raised which will need to be studied by the M&E team after the workshop. A draft FAQ, including definition of internships/outreach period and quality of education- results is attached to this AM and will be incorporated into the operational manual.

44. *Three decisions were taken for the verification and monitoring revenue generation:*

- Revenue generated could be debited in up to four accounts. Often, financiers, including development partners, exist on separate accounts to ensure a straightforward accounting of received funds. Therefore, it is not realistic to assume that all generated revenue can go into one single account. However, the ACE should be in charge of the generated revenue in order to count towards disbursements, including for revenue generated for tuition fees. In case, only a share of the revenue generated from an activity (such as tuition fees) is debited to
- A simple standard table for reporting of generated revenue was shared. This serves the basis for verification of generated revenue.
- The verification of the generated revenue will be undertaken by the financial auditor as part of the annual audit.

45. After the workshop the M&E team met with the five verification pilot ACEs to address missing data issues and with the Cote d'Ivoire ACEs to clarify EEPs and support to get disbursement as early as possible.

46. Key next steps for Monitoring and Evaluation:

- Update the definitions of DLIs
- Share the documents and post on the AAU website
- Set up a meeting with M&E and centers leaders for technical support and more clarification for readiness for verification
- Provide technical support for the data verification process
- **Next submission of the indicators for disbursement and for M&E is October 15, 2016.**

Financial Management

47. The World Bank's Financial Management (FM) Team participated fully in the workshop, with the key objective of facilitating and supporting the AAU in ensuring that participating ACEs have a thorough understanding of their fiduciary responsibilities. FM involvement during the workshop focused on the following:

- Discussion on the key elements of financial management and how it affects project implementation,
- Discussions on the disbursement arrangements for the ACE projects,
- Review and obtain updates on the key FM Action Plans as agreed during the last workshop,
- Clarity on compliance and verification protocols for the FM-related Disbursement Linked Results, i.e. DLI -3
- Compliance with financial covenants as per the respective Financing Agreement, particularly regarding the submission of acceptable unaudited Interim Financial Report (IFR) and the Annual Audit Reports.

Most of the above issues formed the basis of a presentations to participants and an interactive session to provide clarification and direction on how these are interpreted according to the Bank's FM and disbursement guidelines.

48. *Financial Management and Disbursement Arrangements:* The discussion centered on the key elements of financial management, as it pertains to the ACE project. Participants were provided guidelines and sources of references i.e. the Financing Agreement, the Regional Operational Manual, Disbursement Letter and the Project Appraisal Document. On disbursement arrangements, the key issue of concern was how the mechanism of advances and subsequent replenishment of the designated account work. The Bank team provided a walk-through of the processes of the types of supporting documentation required, including IFRs and the EEPs, and how these must be prepared. It was obvious that there is the need for continuous interaction between the AAU and the ACEs and their respective World Bank Country-Office FMS to ensure that accountants working on the project understand the various guidelines.

49. *Update on Key FM Action Plans -* The FM readiness actions expected from all participating ACEs revolves around seven key parameters as follows:

- Accounts Staff – recruitment of technically competent accounting staff
- Internal Audit – establishment of a functioning Internal Audit Unit
- Functioning Audit Committee
- Computerized Accounting System
- Financial Reporting – quality and content and format of acceptable IFR
- External Audit Compliance
- Transparency & public disclosure of financial information

The Bank team, with support from the Head of Finance for AAU, had the ACEs report on the status of compliance of the above agreed indicators. Most of the ACEs had complied with the parameters, and those who are yet to fully comply will be followed up by the AAU and the respective Bank country-office FM specialist.

50. A key issue which came up during the deliberations was the need for the ACEs to be oriented on the importance of corporate governance and strengthening of oversight practices within the ACE and the Universities as whole. This issue was as a result of the Project requesting public disclosure of financial information. From the discussion, it may appear that the ACEs and Universities have focused primarily on their core mandate of teaching and research with less regard for corporate governance and public oversight. There are notably good practices in some of the Universities, but most do not adhere to standard good governance practices. This could well be an oversight or a lack of adequate awareness of modern trends in managing Universities as non-profit Public Interest Entities (PIE). Certainly within the Universities there are systems of rules, regulations and procedures to ensure good governance, but there is the need to translate this to the broader stakeholders. The suggestion going forward will be for the Bank and AAU to collaborate on creating this awareness at the higher levels of University management on the importance of good corporate governance in the ACEs which will go beyond the current project specifics of ensuring that IFRs and audits are done on time and disclosed on the internet.

51. *Compliance with DLI 3 – Timely, Transparent and Institutionally Reviewed Financial Management-* In ensuring full compliance with DLI 3, there are 4 separate but related DLRs which the ACE are expected to achieve:

- DLR 3.1 Timely withdrawal applications supported by adequate financial reporting for the participating University's (ACE) for the period

- DLR 3.2 Functioning Audit Committee under the participating University’s (ACE) council
- DLR 3.3 Functioning Internal Audit Unit for the participating ACE and the University
- DLR 3.4 Transparency on financial management and web access to audit reports, periodic IFR, budgets etc.

52. The Bank FM team explained and provided guidance notes to the participants on how these DLRs will be measured by the Independent Verifier and what the Bank will consider as satisfactory and acceptable evidence for compliance in order to qualify for fund release. It was agreed that AAU will follow up with ACEs who indicated that they have fully complied with the above DLRs and assist them in collating the documentary evidence for the next Withdrawal Application.

53. Related to the above, the team clarified that to meet DLR 2.7, ACEs must include in their audit ToRs the need for the auditor to audit and disclose the revenues earned by the ACE as detailed in the DLR. Thus, it was agreed that the annual audit reports will be the standard reference for verification of the revenue amounts.

54. Financial Covenants as per the Financing Agreements - The FM team explained the financial covenant by which the ACEs are legally obligated, as per Section II sub section B of the Financing Agreements. The team explained the distinction between the various reports and how the Interim Financial Reports (IFR) serve a dual purpose of meeting the financial covenants of semi-annual reporting and also used as part of the supporting documentation for processing withdrawals. On submission of annual audit reports, the team re-emphasized the need to ensure compliance with the June submission deadline date and subsequent public (online) disclosure of the ACE financial statements in the first year and that of the Universities in subsequent years.

55. Next Steps & Action Plan on Financial Management

No.	Issue or Action	Responsibility	Target Date
i.	Submission of annual audited report and reporting on FM results (DLR3.1-3.4)	ACEs and NUC (for Nigeria) – coordinated by the AAU	Not later than June 30, 2016
ii.	Provide updated status on the seven FM parameters	AAU & respective CO FMS	Not later than June 30, 2016
iii.	Submission of half year IFR	ACEs and WB CO FMS	Not later than August 15, 2016
iv.	Conduct FM implementation support mission and review of ACEs systems	Respective WB CO FMS	Not later than September 30, 2016
v.	Need to create awareness on improved transparency as an element of good corporate governance in ACEs	AAU and the World Bank	TBD or as a session during the next ACE workshop
vi.	Assist the ACEs to provide evidence of compliance to FM related DLRs	AAU and World Bank	On-going basis

56. *Financial Management Conclusion* - The workshop presented an excellent opportunity for the Bank, AAU to interact with the ACEs focal persons and staff responsible for fiduciary compliance and served as an avenue to provide clarification, explain IDA FM and disbursement guidelines. The key ‘take home’ is the need for regular interaction between the ACEs, government

focal points/teams and the AAU on any matters that appear to hinder implementation, and for escalation of such issues to the Bank through the respective WB Country-office FMS to ensure a speedy resolution. It would appear that if this chain of addressing matters is not effectively used, ACEs will delay implementation due to lack of clarity and adequate guidance.

Compliance with Environment and Social Safeguards

57. *All ACE activities must comply with the World Bank environment and social safeguards.* So far, this compliance has only been relevant new for construction activities. All ACEs with construction activities are requested to share the construction plans and any relevant initial environment assessment of the planned construction with the Bank. Notably, any potential resettlement issues including informal land users issues must be handled in an orderly manner according to the Bank guidelines. If deemed necessary by the WB safeguard specialist, a set of standard ToRs for a simple environmental assessment (3 weeks) is available from the Bank team and in the operational manual. The following ACEs plan construction according to our information:

ACE	Progress on safeguard approval of new construction		
	Documentation under preparation and exchange with WB safeguard specialist	Information submitted to the Bank team	Approved
CETIC – Cameroon			
CERSA- Togo			
MITIC – Senegal	X	X	X
2IE – Burkina			
SMA – Benin			
CCBAD-Cote d’Ivoire			
Ghana			
RESCK-KNUST			
WACCBIP - UG			
WACCI - UG			
Nigeria			
OAU			
ACEGID – RUN			
CEFOR			
CEFTOR - BSU	X		
CDA - BUK	X		

58. *Country-level information meetings regarding safeguard policies.* To speed up this review process, the Nigeria and Ghana teams (ACE, government and WB) will organize a video conference or meeting to review safeguard compliance and plan any necessary steps. The Bank team including safeguards specialists are available for similar meetings for the other countries.

D. Sectoral Status and Regional Project Facilitation

59. *International accreditation across disciplines* has continued to be one of the more challenging DLRs for the ACEs, with only one ACE having achieved current international

accreditation for its programs. Support was provided to link the centers to potential accrediting agencies: HCERES (for Francophone ACEs) and ABET (for ACEs with programs in engineering, computing, and applied science). During the workshop, two groups of ACEs developed plans to bring consultants from HCERES and ABET to one of the ACEs in the region for a joint workshop, which will launch their self-evaluations as the first step in the accreditation process. The ACEs were encouraged to engage with an international accrediting agency early and to work with that agency on a self-evaluation and gap analysis, which are also eligible for disbursements under DLI 2.5. An ongoing challenge for the program has been to find an international accreditation agency suitable for the Anglophone agriculture ACEs, which are covered neither by HCERES nor by any of the agencies already engaged for the STEM and Health ACEs. At the workshop the ACEs were also presented with “Dos and Don’ts” for accreditation, clarifying that universities cannot accredit their own programs and that accreditation must be undertaken by recognized, specialized evaluation agencies (rather than, e.g., trade groups).

Health

60. *Each health ACE provided a summary of their progress to date with emphasis on the interim six months since the 4th project workshop.* All centers were prepared to present updates with presentations done by center leaders, deputy center leaders or center faculty. All the update presentations are available as an annex to this report. The health ACEs as a group discussed common challenges affecting most ACEs currently. These challenges include:

- Accreditation
- Center faculty status
- Publications – relevance and topics
- Faculty incentive
- Regional student support
- Student expectations
- Partnership
- Outreach Periods/Industry relationships
- Revenue
- Environmental Monitors
- Center Leadership

61. Highlights of the topics discussed can be found in the Ghana Health Session Presentation annex. A brief summary of the Health ACEs’ strengths and weaknesses are provided here, for full details of the Health ACEs’ progress see the annex.

62. *WACCBIP – University Ghana Legon.* Strengths: The centre has successfully obtained a grant from the Wellcome Trust DELTAS program and are using this grant to complement the funding provided by the ACE project to provide student scholarships, supporting regional student cost and post-doctoral student salaries who are integral in assisting graduate students on a day to day basis. They have also acquired their major scientific equipment to support the development of their core research facility improving access for faculty and students for research and education. Their first cohort of master students are on track to graduate in the coming year with a second cohort enrolled to follow. WACCBIP has engaged the Royal Society for Biology for international accreditation and is undergoing the self assessment phase right now with site visit planned for fall 2016. To

date the center has a 54 published articles in a variety of journals including high impact journals such as PLoS.

Recommendations:

- Enhance regional recruitment strategy identifying ways to publicize better the degree programs
- Expand opportunities for outreach for faculty and staff

63. *ACENTDFB – Ahmadu Bello University.* Strengths: Two short courses are running, training over 80 students. Masters and PhD degree programs are well enrolled. The post graduate diploma in forensic biotechnology is now running with 12 students as a step to getting the masters degree started. Center faculty have received several awards and papers have been published in high impact journals. The center is now providing all the testing for onchocerciasis for Kaduna state and faculty/students are spending outreach periods in field sampling through this partnership. New classrooms and laboratories are installed.

Recommendations:

- Begin international accreditation process – source identified through the Royal Society for Biology
- Initiate faculty incentive programs through paper publication fee support, seed funding for research projects, assisting with cost for outreach
- Network with regional and ACE partners to help increase regional student recruitment.

64. *ACEGID – Redeemer's University.* Strengths: Expanding in-country genomic surveillance within West Africa for ebola with sites in Senegal, Sierra Leone and Nigeria. ACEGID has developed RDTs for Lassa and Ebola viruses to allow for quick bedside diagnostics and also a potential source for revenue. Recruiting back West African Diaspora to work at the center. Large number of high impact publications. Successful grant applications.

Recommendations:

- Seek international and national accreditation. Center has self-identified the CAPES accreditation program.
- Increase regional student attendance. Challenges have been tuition fees due to Redeemer's status as a private university.
- Industry partners since there are no other genomics centers in West or most of Africa.

65. *ACEPRD – University of Jos.* Strengths: Center has two new degree programs running with national and regional students enrolled. They have developed a collaboration with Bank of Industry. They held an international conference for phytomedicine in February 2016. A drosophila workshop was held also in February. Several short courses

are planned for this coming year. A publication list since the center started has been assembled. Some learning equipment procured and in place but not yet fully functional.

Recommendations:

- Continue developing new curriculum for new masters and PhD programs not yet launched as a major goal of the center
- Seek accreditations both national and international. The Royal Society of Biology was identified as a source for accreditation.
- Develop a support system and standard intake/orientation for regional students to address student challenges
- Better identify core center faculty for teaching and paper publication
- Develop faculty incentive systems to increase participation. Suggestions discussed include seed funding for research and publication fees.

66. *CEA-SAMEF - University Cheikh Anta Diop.* The center has 4 of 6 of its one year DU programs running with strong student enrollment in those courses. The remaining to be launched required ordered learning/new medical equipment. Strong enrollment in the masters and PhD level public health degrees with the nutrition masters to come. Short courses have been run, training nearly 100 students. In an effort to increase and modernize teachers three different three-day teaching methodology training sessions were held. The center has initiated accreditation with the Royal College of Physicians and Surgeons. The publication rate of the center to date has exceeded the predicted target.

Recommendations:

- Develop the list of identified partners (university and industry) through meetings and exchanges to develop common projects and investments with partners to further deepen the partnership.
- Increase advertisement and networking through university partners and other French speaking universities in West Africa to increase regional student enrollment
- In procurement of medical equipment and medical bus ensure equipment and bus have a service and maintenance plan as part of the proposal for purchase. Also be sure the instruments in the medical bus can tolerate the sometimes rough conditions of the road. As an example, during the ebola outbreak mobile laboratories failed as when the buses were moved the equipment was no long calibrated or was damaged. Be sure to evaluate the sensitivity of the equipment in the medical bus.
- For increased revenue generation through grants consider holding a grant writing seminar/training for faculty to increase skills in this area and allow for time to develop the proposals in a group/multidisciplinary setting.

67. *CERHI – University of Benin City.* The center started all five of its degree programs during this past semester after developing the curriculum. One short course has been completed and the planning for several more are underway. Given the space constraints to hold this many new classes at the university the center building which will house

classrooms has been started and is 20% complete. Outreach periods are planned as part of the new degree programs and potential partners have been developed. Learning equipment has been procured but is not yet in use. Some revenue through tuition/fees and grants has been generated. Faculty designation for the center has occurred but is lower in volume than most other centers. Regional students from the Gambia have enrolled in the programs but there have been some challenges in hosting/integrating them into the administrative system of the university.

Recommendations:

- Time-availability of the Center Leader Center is limited due to other tasks, which requires actions, for example through strong and empowered deputy center leadership.
- The center is at an important time with courses now implemented to move forward the other components of the center programming in an effort to achieve deliverables focusing on the center mission and strategy will be very important to success.
- Further develop and motivate the center faculty through the process of defining research topics at research meeting to help promote cross department collaboration and identify more center faculty members given number registered for publication review is low compared to other centers.
- Incentivizing faculty through open competition for seed funding for research, paper publication and outreach/intern experiences is a non-salary way to increase the satisfaction of faculty.
- Student feedback for new courses will be essential and the faculty should work toward a system of student evaluations to undertake continuous improvement in new courses.
- Develop a system to receive and orient administratively regional students
- While the center building is under construction, begin using the learning equipment in the temporary center space to ensure a quality experience for the first year of students enrolled in the degree programs.

68. *Summary conclusions.* The health ACEs are making progress toward their goals and the goals of the ACE project. There are unique challenges at each center due to the university environment, topic area of work or level of existing work prior to the start of the center. The unifying areas where all centers need ongoing development and efforts should be concentrated are:

- Faculty development and incentives – semi-competitive incentives that promote faculty development, academic advancement and achievement of the centers’ goals should be implemented. The need to active, engaged faculty by the end of the ACE support is critical to the sustainability of the centers.
- Processes to support the recruitment and enrollment of regional students. All centers note that advertisement and recruitment of students for degrees and short courses has been a challenge. The AAU could provide potential support for this in advertising on its website and any other regional/continental emailing distribution lists

- Revenue generation has been challenging for most health ACEs as the typical source is grant funding, given that medical ‘products’ are rare in their development and long for approvals and regulatory processes. Effort should be put into education of centers on grant sources and grant writing training/experience.
- Outreach periods for health are more limited depending on the center’s focus as industry is limited depending on the topic. A list of acceptable options for outreach experiences in health would help guide centers in broadening their identification of placement locations.

Agriculture

69. At the Agriculture workshop session the experts coordinated self-reporting and discussion on the best, next best achievement; and the most challenging constraint confronting individual ACE. In the first session, each ACE presented a 5-10 aspect of what they regarded the most excellent transformation. The other agriculture ACE teams assessed, on a scale of 1-5 on how relevant/useful/beneficial the presentation was to them. Discussion help clarify relevance and actions needed for excellence. In the second session each ACE presented their implementation nightmare and suggestions on how to overcome it were given from the floor.

70. *Key success stories.*

- Attracting quality students to the ACE because of ACE reputation, partnerships, advertising, ambassadors of good will, internet visibility and judicious use of available funds to support learning and especially research (WACCI)
- Skillful handling of partnerships for revenue generation (joint proposals, elite visiting lecturers, seed money for partnerships, speedy MoUs). (CDA-BUK)
- Blending graduate programmes with shorter training and leveraging financial support from students, state government and partners (CEFTOR –BSU)
- Industrial partnerships in development of courses, training, research and business (CERSA –Lome)
- Lecturers ability to create well motivated students through student-based learning (attraction of large numbers after adverts, written and oral interviews for admissions and a shift in learning paradigm) (CEADESE-FUNAAB)
- Process used to reach effectiveness and disbursement as fast as possible (Cote d’Ivoire)

71. *Key Challenges.*

- Lack of financial autonomy within the university leading to delays in release of funds and loss of time and motivation (nearly all). Suggestions: Negotiate sufficient autonomy using whatever leverage possible (e.g. DLIs, WB, consultations and administrative workshops)
- Attracting sufficient numbers of regional and female students especially difficult in Nigeria and most difficult in Northern Nigeria Suggestions: Provide security, support and use of peer advertising,
- Revenue generation: Suggestions: Fees (low income source); industrial production; joint research; corporate socio responsibility (potential), subsidiary companies, educate governments;
- Accreditation: Suggestions: National mechanisms; African consortium in agriculture; Use of existing experts; external review panel reports; self-evaluation

- Participation incentives: Suggestions: Make the ACE attractive to staff as well as to students through use of alternative income streams

72. In conclusion, the Agriculture ACE side meeting during the 5th ACE workshop was designed to maximize learning from each other. The evaluation conducted was about relevance of sister ACE learning rather than performance of the reporting ACE. It came out that for an ACE to be excellent it needed to:

- Consider student welfare while attracting quality students
- Consider staff welfare in addition to attracting their contribution
- Enhance the learning environment and infrastructure
- Appropriate external input (funds, knowledge, skills) in addition to those available
- Adopt clever techniques for raising and using funds
- Judicious use of friends and contacts as goodwill ambassadors
- Learn from one another

Science technologie ingénierie et mathématiques (STIM)

73. *Summary Session STEM.* The session went well and the results presented by all the ACEs are substantial and promising. The new ACE of Cote d'Ivoire has demonstrated a real potential for development and a willingness to sharing and synergy with other ACE in the sub-region. The challenges faced by all ACE concern mainly the following points.

- *Accreditation.* Accreditation, including international accreditation is a long, difficult and expensive process. It often calls for educational reforms, revision of curricula and strengthening educational and scientific infrastructure and human resources. All of the 5 ACE are therefore worried about achieving the indicator related to this international accreditation in the timing of the project. Therefore, the ACEs recommend to overlap the indicator in question (and the disbursements related thereto) according to the levels of advancement of the ACE in the international accreditation process (early, mid-term and completion)
- The other challenge concerns the *regional accreditation*, especially in the Francophone set up. Indeed, apart from the CAMES, what are the alternatives for regional accreditation solutions in the project timing? ACE are AS therefore recommend that the World Bank reconsider the possibility of working with the CAM to develop and implement accreditation programs for Francophone CEAS.
- *Relations with the private sector.* These relationships are crucial in income generation, employability of graduates and the sustainability of the ACE. They must be win-win partnerships based on mutual trust. But the challenge is the confidentiality and protection of information and results, that is to say, the issue of intellectual property. Most ACEs are yet to fully integrate this concept and it

becomes urgent and essential to work towards it if we want strong relations with sustainable and successful businesses. Training and capacity building are necessary to achieve this.

- *Scientific production.* All ACEs showed high levels of scientific output, anything showing the dynamism and quality of research conducted in the ACEs. But the challenge is how to assess the quality of scientific research. In addition to peer-reviewed articles, other popular articles that constitute a real transfer vector of scientific and technological innovations to end-users and policymakers, and which have real impacts on development. ACEs CEAS recommend that these aspects are taken into account by Elsevier, which should also provide the details of the evaluation criteria of scientific production, ACE also emphasized on the need for access to quality scientific bibliographic resources (subscription to the full texts of scientific journals) to conduct international standard research. Facilitation from the Bank is sought on this point.

Regional Facilitation

74. *Overall Impression on the regional facilitation:* The World Bank and AAU expressed satisfaction with the organization and execution of the PSC Meeting and ACE Project Workshop and improved facilitation of the project at the regional level.

75. *Regular Planning of the WB/AAU Meetings.* AAU and the WB agreed on a regular meeting schedule to ensure good planning and advanced notice to participants. In particular, the teams would meet on a biweekly basis over the phone or internet on Thursdays at 2pm (Ghana time) starting Thursday June 9.

76. *Recruiting of an ACE Officer:* The recruitment process has been delayed due to an objection by the World Bank on the process followed. The Bank acknowledged that AAU has the right to recruit somebody it could work with. The AAU will present the matter to the AAU Governing Board at its meeting in June 2016 and the outcome would be communicated to World Bank.

77. *Contribution to AAU Institutional Overhead:* it was agreed that AAU will provide a justification for this contribution in terms of costs for various items such as utility bills; generator fuel costs; office space, etc. Thereafter World Bank would review it, and a percentage would be discussed and agreed upon.

78. *New AAU Vehicle:* Because of the improved financial reporting of the ACE project operations and better understanding of the project management procedures, coupled with the need to facilitate ACE project activities, and the envisaged activities under the PASET and Benchmarking Projects, in which AAU plays a key role, AAU renewed the request for a vehicle. It was agreed that AAU should send a formal request to that effect to the Bank for consideration.

Attachments (in electronic version)

Annex 1: Progress and challenges for each ACE

Annex 2: Suggested Template for semi-annual Procurement reporting

Annex 3: Workshop Agenda and participants List

Annex 4: ACE Results Framework

Annex 5: Detailed Supervision report and action plan for CERSA, Togo and for 2iE, Burkina Faso

**ANNEX 1:
ACE SPECIFIC IMPLEMENTATION PROGRESS, ISSUES AND AGREED NEXT
STEPS/RECOMMENDATIONS**

Component 1: Centers of excellence

Progress	Issues	Next Steps and recommendations
NIGERIA		
AFRICAN UNIVERSITY OF SCIENCE AND TECHNOLOGY, ABUJA		
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Admitted national and international students in active programmes • Publications in national and international journals • Computerized Accounting System • Appointment of Safeguards Officer • Functional website 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Funding. • Challenge of paying their foreign partners due to poor exchange rate. • Accreditation • Recruitment of Regional students 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Request the NUC to do such transactions for them by asking for direct disbursement to the partners • Apply to the NUC for Resource Verification • Plans to establish Women in Science & Engineering (WISE) programme
UNIVERSITY OF PORT HARCOURT		
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Admitted national and international students in active programmes • Publications in national and international journals • Computerized Accounting System • Robust industry & regional partnerships that lead to increased externally generated revenue • Commissioning of the NLNG Centre for Gas, Refining & Petrochemical Engineering (modular refinery) • Functional website 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Funding. • Accreditation • Recruitment of Regional students 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Will appoint a Safeguards Officer soon • Apply to the NUC for Resource Verification
OBAFEMI AWOLowo UNIVERSITY, ILE-IFE		
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Admitted national and international students (short courses) in active programmes • Publications in national and international journals • Computerized Accounting System • Robust industry & regional partnerships that lead to increased externally generated revenue • Functional website • Appointment of Safeguard Officer • Developed content for online teaching and learning in collaboration with Intel Corporation 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Funding • Accreditation • Procurement issues • Recruitment of Regional students 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Re-advertise for jobs that were contracted out but could be executed due to effect of poor exchange rate after award • The Centre intends to visit 5 West and Central African countries to boost their enrolment drive • Apply to the NUC for Resource Verification • Working with ABET on international accreditation
UNIVERSITY OF BENIN		

Progress	Issues	Next Steps and recommendations
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Strong increase in student intake • Admitted national and international students in active programmes • Publications in national and international journals • Functional website 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Funding • Communication • Accreditation • Recruitment of Regional students 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Planning to put a strategic communication plan in place. • The center is at an important time with courses now implemented to move forward the other components of the center programming in an effort to achieve deliverables focusing on the center mission and strategy will be very important to success. • Further develop and motivate the center faculty through the process of defining research topics at research meeting to help promote cross department collaboration and identify more center faculty members given number registered for publication review is low compared to other centers. • Incentivizing faculty through open competition for seed funding for research, paper publication and outreach/intern experiences is a non-salary way to increase the satisfaction of faculty. • Student feedback for new courses will be essential and the faculty should work toward a system of student evaluations to undertake continuous improvement in new courses. • Develop a system to receive and orient administratively regional students • While the center building is under construction, begin using the learning equipment in the temporary center space to ensure a quality experience for the first year of students enrolled in the degree programs. • Apply to the NUC for Resource Verification • Appoint a Safeguard Officer • Accounting System to be computerized
AHMADOU BELLO UNIVERSITY, ZARIA		
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Admitted national and international students in active programmes • Publications in national and international journals • Computerized Accounting System (in process) • Robust partnerships Federal Health and Security Agencies and Kaduna State Ministry of Health • Functional website • Appointment of Safeguard Officer • Procured materials and equipment for improved teaching and learning, as well as secured approval for new animal house 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Funding • Accreditation • Recruitment of Regional students 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Begin international accreditation process – source identified through the Royal Society for Biology • Initiate faculty incentive programs through paper publication fee support, seed funding for research projects, assisting with cost for outreach • Network with regional and ACE partners to help increase regional student recruitment. • Apply to the NUC for Resource Verification
UNIVERSITY OF JOS		
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Admitted national and international students in active programmes • Publications in national and international journals • Robust partnership with industry (Bank of Industry and National 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Funding • Accreditation • Recruitment of Regional students 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Continue developing new curriculum for new masters and PhD programs not yet launched as a major goal of the center • Seek accreditations both national and international. The Royal Society of Biology was identified as a source for accreditation.

Progress	Issues	Next Steps and recommendations
<p>Office of Technology Acquisition Programme)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Functional website 		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Develop a support system and standard intake/orientation for regional students to address student challenges • Better identify core center faculty for teaching and paper publication • Develop faculty incentive systems to increase participation. Suggestions discussed include seed funding for research and publication fees. • Apply to NUC for Resource Verification • Accounting System to be computerized • Appointment of Safeguard Officer if needed
REDEEMERS UNIVERSTIY, EDE		
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Admitted national and international students in active programmes • Development of testing kit for Ebola • Development of testing kit for Lassa Fever • Publications in national and international journals • Robust partnerships leading to increased externally generated revenue 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Funding • Accreditation • Government bureaucracy • Recruitment of Regional students • Security issues 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Seek international and national accreditation. Center has self-identified the CAPES accreditation program. • Increase regional student attendance. Challenges have been tuition fees due to Redeemer’s status as a private university. • Industry partners since there are no other genomics centers in West or most of Africa. • Need the World Bank to intervene in the funding issues. • Apply to the NUC for Resource Verification • Accounting System to be computerized • Appointment of Safeguard Officer
BENUE STATE UNIVERSITY, MAKURDI		
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Admitted national and international students in active programmes • Publications in national and international journals • Robust partnerships with Benue State Government and other Universities and research institutes for training needs • Functional website • Appointment of Safeguard Officer 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Funding • Accreditation • Internally Generated Revenue • Recruitment of Regional students 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Seek international and national accreditation. Center has self identified the CAPES accreditation program. • Increase regional student attendance. Challenges have been tuition fees due to Redeemer’s status as a private university. • Industry partners since there are no other genomics centers in West or most of Africa. • Look for more support in terms of consultancy and other jobs to do so as to generate more revenue • Proposing a Faculty of Food Sciences which will boost generation of funds. • Computerization of Accounting System • Apply to the NUC for Resource Verification • Reaching out to embassies and high commissions in Nigeria to sell the programmes of their ACE.
FEDERAL UNIVERSITY OF AGRICULTURE, ABEOKUTA		
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Admitted national and international students in active programmes • Publications in national and international journals • Computerized Accounting System • Functional website • Appointment of Safeguard Officer 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Funding • Difficulty in getting spending approval from the University, i.e. from the Vice Chancellor. When 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Always write to the Vice Chancellor with “Urgent” stamp on the memo. • Will write the NUC and the WB to assist in letting the university give more autonomy to the Centre Leader • Apply to the NUC for Resource Verification

Progress	Issues	Next Steps and recommendations
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Robust industry & regional partnerships that lead to increased externally generated revenue 	<p>he is not available, things are stalled.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Recruitment of Regional students Accreditation 	
BAYERO UNIVERSITY, KANO		
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Admitted national and international students in active programmes Publications in national and international journals Computerized Accounting System (in process) Robust partnerships with industry, institutions and regional bodies leading to increased externally generated revenue. Functional website Appointment of Safeguard Officer 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Funding Vague information on disbursements Conflicting issues of travel rates Accreditation Recruitment of Regional students 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Need the World Bank to clarify the conflicting travel rates issue The World Bank also needs to clarify the vague information on disbursements Apply to the NUC for Resource Verification
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> GHANA 		
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> KUMASI UNIVERSITY OF SCIENCE AND TECHNOLOGY (KNUST) Regional Water Center in Sanitation 		
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Disbursement of advance and achievement of DLI 1 has both been completed with the center having at least \$2 million in disbursement funds Successful launch of regional water sanitation center was launched with multiple stakeholders in March 2016 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The progress has been slow, but is picking up. Delayed project approval hindered the center team from investing fully in implementation, however with recent disbursements, the team is ready to move fast Issue around center leadership with the main challenge on decision flows raised. The center leader noted that the project will be fully implemented by the project team under the deputy center leader and center leader supervision 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Time-availability of the Center Leader Center is limited due to other tasks, which requires actions, for example through strong and empowered deputy center leadership. Next steps on the construction of the site of the center is on-going with construction expected to start in July 2016 Specification of DLI 2.8 was discussed and agreed with the center agreeing to reword the center milestones to be more specific and within line of the 4 milestone approach

Progress	Issues	Next Steps and recommendations
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Won a large grant from the Wellcome Trust DELTAS program • Acquired major scientific equipment for faculty and students for research and education. • First cohort of master students are on track to graduate • Engaged the Royal Society for Biology for international accreditation and is undergoing the self assessment phase with site visit planned for fall 2016. • The center has a 54 published articles including in high impact journals such as PLoS. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Low regional student recruitment 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Enhance regional recruitment strategy identifying ways to publicize better the degree programs • Expand opportunities for outreach for faculty and staff

Progress	Issues	Next Steps and recommendations
SENEGAL		
SAMEF – UCAD		
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • CEA-SAMEF on good track toward international accreditation with HCERES and College Royal form Canada. Strong commitment from the high level authorities and health department to support the center. The IFR has been submitted and approved by the FM of the World Bank, but just concern the ACE account. ToRs for external audit 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The center focused more on short term courses. The statute of the center needs to be designed in line with the ongoing reforms. The implementation of the LND system in the context of the Health department of UCAD is a key issue. No short term course for the Gynecology has been undertaken in the Center. The communication is lagging behind with no existing of website of the ACE. The internal audit commission is established but not still fully functional 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Get together to find out relevant mechanisms to implement the LMD system in the health department. • Undertaken high level discussions with key stakeholders about The status of centers of excellence within the university and health department in line with ongoing reforms • Pursue the process of validation of the referential for the national accreditation of the medicine programs. • Join preparation with UGB of the National launch of the two centers of excellences • strengthen the communication to make the center more visible and impactful at the national and regional levels • Provide the utilization plan of medicalized bus. Also be sure the instruments in the medical bus can tolerate the sometimes rough conditions of the road. As an example, during the ebola outbreak mobile laboratories failed as when the buses were moved the equipment was no long calibrated or was damaged. Be sure to evaluate the sensitivity of equipment in the medical bus. • Undertaken the deliverance of short term courses in Gynecology which is very important also for the Mother health • Develop the list of identified partners (university and industry) through meetings and exchanges to develop common projects and investments with partners to further deepen the partnership. • Increase advertisement and networking through university partners and other French speaking universities in West Africa to increase regional student enrollment • For increased revenue generation through grants consider holding a grant writing seminar/training for faculty to increase skills in this area and allow for time

Progress	Issues	Next Steps and recommendations
		to develop the proposals in a group/multidisciplinary setting.
MITIC-UGB		
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> CEA-MITIC are on good track to concretize the regionality. Innovative and cost effective approach has been developed to training Gambian Students. The strategy of communication and outreach is well being implemented with high level meetings and events organized since the last workshop. Process has started with International Accreditation. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Still need to find a best option for the accommodation for foreign students in the context of overcrowding of national of universities. The revenue generated are very low compared to the expectation. Few numbers of PhD students has been enrolled so far. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Submit in a timely manner the latest version of the RF. Discussion with the High education directorate and the national Science academic to find an international agency for accreditation. Join preparation with UCAD of the National launch of the two centers of excellence (end of 2015 or earlier 2016, TBD). Strong efforts needed to reinforce the potential of center to generate sufficient revenues so that to promote the sustainability.

Component 2: Enhancing Improving Quality

Objective: To improve the quality of education service provision

Sub-component	Progress	Issues	Next Steps
AAU-			
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The AAU has continued project coordination and support with number of activities completed including 8 PSC meetings, 5 regional ACE workshops and a number of capacity building activities including revenue generation 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> There has been an improvement in the costs and financial management presentation with respect to charges on operational costs. DLI verification consultancy has been hired with verification of 5 pilot centers on-going and the remaining 14 expected to start in July 2016 Bibliometric DLI consultancy has also been awarded and the first round of verification of the results publication DLI is on-going Additional revenue generation workshop was held in Nigeria and Cote d' Ivoire to provide capacity building support to the centers. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> There has been some discussion on the staffing at AAU and the Bank team is working closely with AAU to finalize the ToRs and staffing structure 	
NUC			
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The NUC has successfully followed up on the 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> NUC finally opened a \$ account and Naira account at the CBN in April 2016 after 8 month delay 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Huge challenges with respect to disbursement 	<ul style="list-style-type: none">

Sub-component	Progress	Issues	Next Steps
disbursement to all the ACEs	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • NUC needs to follow up on the M&E, procurement and FM support of the project • Country level workshop was held in January 2016 for the Nigerian ACEs on M&E, procurement and general buy-in of the Nigeria Vice Chancellors to the project. • 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • flow to the NUC and Nigerian centers. • Currency issues for the ACEs has been addressed by NUC 	
The Gambia			
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The Gambia has finalized all the contracts for the students to start MSc, short-term and PHD courses 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 141 students are embarking on their studies at the 7 ACEs. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Following project monitoring mission by the Gambia PS to Nigeria, Ghana and Cameroon there was good progress of students settling in to the programs but some issues around students at Benin City in Nigeria have been raised to NUC. In particular student accommodation and the lack of teaching at the center and registration of the students. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Follow up with centers in which Gambian students are enrolled in to make sure the students are learning and settled in well. In particular at Benin City and CETIC, Cameroon

Annex 2: Suggested Template for semi-annual procurement reporting

Description	Contracts Completed	Contracts On-going	Pre-Contract Stage	Proc yet to Initiate Proc	Terminated
Goods	10	0	0	5	
No %	67	-	-	33	
Amt	988,225.16	-	-	127,000.00	
Amt %	89	-	-	11	
Works	-	1	0	1	
No %	0	50	-	50	
Amt		325,000.00	-	20,000.00	
Amt %	-	94	-	6	
Consultancy Services	13	0	0	10	
No %	54	-	0	0	
Amt	604,000.00	-	0	468,000	36,000
Amt %	55	-	-	42	
Non-Consultancy Services					
No %	-	-	0	0	
Amt					
Amt %	-	-	-	-	
GRAND SUMMARY					
Total No.	23	1	-	16	1
No %					
Total Amt	1,592,225	325,000	-	615,000	36,000
Amt %					

Annexe 5 Rapport de supervision détaillé du CERSA et 2iE

CERSA Togo

Statuts - Togo - Following the Fourth ACE Project Workshop held in Cotonou in November 2015, and a supervision mission from 21 to 23 March 2016, the World Bank team wishes to congratulate CERSA for the significant progress made in the implementation the project, and strongly encourages to continue its efforts to achieve project indicators.

The effort made by CERSA towards organizing a meeting in March 2016, with leaders of the private sector in Togo, is an example of good practice. The World Bank invites the CERSA to pursue this openness to the private sector.

The implementation of CERSA revolves around the following five action plans: 1. Excellence in governance and operation; 2. Excellence in education and training; 3. Excellence in research; 4. Development Impact 5. Strengthening educational and research infrastructures. These action plans guide the implementation of the Centre's activities. The following summarizes the (i) progress made in the implementation of these five areas and (ii) conclusions and recommendations, jointly produced by the CERSA and mission of the World Bank at the end of the debate and analysis of the documents.

Action Plan 1: Excellence in governance and operations

- CERSA oversight. CERSA's steering bodies are operational and are made up with eight commissions which meet on regular basis. The steering committee meets twice a year. The World Bank team supports this organization, which promotes project management. It recommends strengthening the internal communication within the University and maintain efficient allocation of tasks to enable the Coordinator to be positioned in a more strategically dimension for the Centre. The administration of CERSA is in place and supported by technical staff. Since January 2016, procurement, communication, financial management specialists were recruited and assumed office in the Centre of Excellence.
- Monitoring and Evaluation. The monitoring and evaluation system is operational and contributes to an effective monitoring of information. To recall, the reporting of information by the different actors is the responsibility of everyone. The team recommends the finalization of the monitoring framework plan of activities and achievements of indicators before 30 June 2016.
- Fiduciary Management. An external audit firm has been engaged in January 2016. The purchase of the accounting software remains an important recommendation which is yet to be fulfilled by the Centre. The team reiterates the importance of acquiring as faster as earlier as possible the recommended

- accounting software. Regarding procurement, as agreed in the DLI 4.1, it is recommended to conduct an audit of contracts before 30th June 2016.
- Communication. The team congratulates CERSA for officially launching the Center at national level as well as producing a documentary about the Center.
 - The World Bank invites the teams to continue in this direction by strengthening communication operations for the CERSA. Thus the mission recommends to finalize the strategic communication plan and upload it on the website in order to enhance the visibility of the Centre of Excellence.
 - Capacity Building. Capacity building related activities are organized both at national and regional level. Regarding the training in income generation, the team recommends an actual income generation strategy for CERSA in order to significantly improve the income of the Centre. It is necessary to plan before June 15 study tours for teachers working in CERSA. The chosen theme should be part of the overall objective of the project. (For example, introduction of new teaching methods).
 - Environmental and Social Safeguard. CERSA received a national certification approval for the Environmental and Social Management Plan (ESMP) from the National Agency of Environmental Management (ANGEL-Togo) to undertake rehabilitation operations. The team indicated that all the documents relating to environmental and social issues should be sent by May 30, 2016.
 - Partnerships. Partnership agreements were signed: two regional and 4 international. The team recommends strengthening of the partnerships through concrete and rewarding actions for CERSA.

Action Plan 2: Excellence in education and training

ACTIVITIES	RÉALISATIONS (Mai 2016)
Development of experiential training programs	3 new curricula developed
	National approval by order of the President of UL
	Notse workshop on quality assurance of training programmes
Training of Master students	27 students enrolled, including 8 regional students
	Work placement (internship) of the 27 students
	support missions of Belgian, Dutch, French and Nigerian experts in the development of curricula and teaching 100% in the 1 st semester and 30% in the 2 nd semester
Training of PhD students	6 PhD students, including one regional student
	131 young entrepreneurs trained, including 106 from FAIEJ

modular training and professional courses	Revenue generated: \$US 55,985.3
Capacity building of faculty	74 lecturers researchers have been trained in 7 CERSA thematic for 5 days
National and International Accreditation	Commitment to international accreditation process: Sending a letter of intent to HCERS

79. Togo - Planning Next Steps.

Regarding the last 3 action plans: (i) Excellence in research; (ii) development impact; and (iii) Strengthening of educational and research facilities, the team advises the Centre to accelerate activities related to these action plans. Beyond the above recommendations, the World Bank team invites the CERSA and the Ministry of Higher Education and Research to make meaningful progress in the next 6 months on the following:

- Develop a partnership strategy with industry at national and international level in order for the Centre to significantly improve its revenue generation.
- Make changes on the legal status of the Centre to facilitate the implementation of CERSA program.
- In order to improve the implementation of the program, the team suggests to CERSA to rigorously follow the following roadmap.

N°	Sector	Recommendations	Person responsible	Deadline
1	National / international Accreditation	• Develop a specific work program	Nenonene	June 30
		• Work with the person responsible for the quality of education in Togo	Nenonene	June 30
		• Work session with the officer in charge of Quality of teaching in the University / Agree on evaluation forms	Nenonene	June 30
		• Request evaluation and methodology forms from ANO WB	Tona	July 15
		• Meet with HCERES and all CEA	Nenonene	14-15 july
		• Improve communication plan based on comments and suggestions, and submit it to the WB communications specialist in Togo	Fernand Tona	July 15

2	Communication Plan / CERSAM site web/documentary	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Produce Success stories (or " human stories " 	Fernand Tona	July 30
3	Monitoring & Evaluation	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The need for faculty to provide the necessary documentation for a study tours 	Agboka	May 30
4	Procurement	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Update the Procurement Plan 	Gildas Balawia	June 30
5	Financial management	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Develop an annual table of DLI- 	Alex Soedjede	June 4
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Purchase of the accounting software 	Alex Soedjede	July 30
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Contact IGF 	Alex Soedjede	30 juin
6	Environment	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Submit to WB Reports and Approval Certificate of ESMP 	Tona	30 mai
7	Partnership	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Formalize the partnership between CERSA, ITRA & CITA & INFA • 	Tona	July 31
8	UCP	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • registration of CNSS staff 	Tona	May 19
9	Training	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Short-term training: publication of the call for applications in June 2016 for the October session. 30 participants. Benin to host training sessions in those countries. • Start the second phase of the Master programme in the CERSA; 	Tona	30 juin

2iE Burkina Faso

A World Bank team including an expert from the Association of African Universities visited ACE 2iE from 9 to 10 May 2016. The team noted with satisfaction the progress made by 2iE in the implementation of the Project. The team met leaders of 2iE as well as students of the Centre of Excellence and private sector companies working in partnership with 2iE (Total, Groupe Vergnet, SOGEA-SATOM). The team also inspected teaching facilities and laboratories of 2iE. At the end of the visit, all parties expressed satisfaction on progress made and the results so far achieved. Concerning solutions to key implementation challenges that may interest other centers of excellence, the team recommended that 2iE should task the general supervision mission to agree on a common ground.

In general, since the Cotonou workshop, ACE 2iE has reached a satisfactory level of the objectives of its implementation plan. Concerning the objectives set out in Cotonou in November 2015, several indicators have reached or exceeded their targets. Only three indicators remain below their targets. These are: (i) the indicator on accredited educational programs that has not changed since 2iE wished, for the moment, to focus on enhancing quality of existing programs; (ii) the indicator on income generation remains at about 40% of the target to be achieved; (iii) the indicator showing the number of newly or revised curriculum is 5, not 7 as expected. Specific actions are being taken to reach the target of all the indicators. The external audit is on track. The Terms of Reference have been submitted and approved by the Bank and the audit will be conducted in June 2016.

According to the implementation plan, since November 2015, the following activities were carried out:

- Recruitment of the second batch of local students on scholarship (February 2016 admission), forty three (43) Master students "Water and Sanitation" and "Water Resources Infrastructure".

November to December 2015

- Validation and publication of the Internal Audit Report
- Recruitment of a firm to undertake studies and civil works in the ACE
- Inventory of work and needs in educational and scientific materials CEA
- Reorganization, planning and budgeting of year 2 activities (30 June 2016) and meeting with officers in charge with other components.
- Preparation of procurement of computers for students and a Generator
-

January to May 2016:

- Report of Semester 1 of Year 2 (October 31, 2015) (submit to AAU)
- Financial reporting of the 2nd semester 2015 (submitted and approved by the WB)
- Completion of the DLI 2.8 (complete list of equipment being finalized)
- Review and submission of the Procurement Plan to the BM (validation underway)
- Submission and validation of external audit TDRs outside the BM
- Participation in the Benchmarking survey on PASET and WB project (April 2016)
- Hosting a delegation from UDS (Partner from Ghana) at 2iE for a working meeting in the framework of ACE-WB project (24-27 April 2016)

80. *Burkina Faso - challenges.* Centre of Excellence 2iE has encountered some difficulties / challenges regarding programming:

- Accreditation: In the French-speaking set up, regional accreditation is a real challenge for Francophone ACE. What are the solutions in project timing?
- Scientific production: How to take into account in assessing the quality of scientific research, in addition to peer-reviewed articles, other popular articles constituting a real channel of transfer of scientific and technological innovations which have a real impact on development?
- The difficulties in the collection and processing of data / information for M & E (compatibility with the existing information system)
- The difficulties in the collection and processing of data / information for M & E (compatibility with the existing information system)
- Students do not understand the reason why English should be a condition for the issuance of CTI degree in Engineering. The institute to review recruitment criteria conditions with a minimum level of English and strengthen the provision of learning from the first year. Possibility of preparatory classes in English.
- The delay in the procurement process (lengthy procurement procedures). Better anticipation for year 2. The exit of the expert in procurement (reorganization of the team pending further recruitment underway).

81. *Burkina Faso – next steps*

- Holding the 2nd meeting of the National Committee for Monitoring and Evaluation (June-July 2016)
- Preparation of procurement and tender documents
- Recruitment of the third and final batch of local scholarship students (beginning of September 2016): 14 Master students
- Undertake of the external audit and audit of procurement (June 2016)